



The Out-of-School Time Leader's
**GUIDE TO EQUITABLE
HIRING AND STAFF
DEVELOPMENT PRACTICES**

Introduction

Currently over 10 million children and youth--many from historically-excluded groups--participate in afterschool and summer programs nationwide. In fact, for every one young person enrolled in an afterschool program there are three more waiting to get in, totalling 25 million kids who aren't able to access programs.¹ At the National AfterSchool Association (NAA), we believe every young person deserves quality, enriching experiences outside of school that positively impact their development and help them thrive, however, currently there are multiple systemic barriers that impact access.

The Challenge: Underrepresentation and Discrimination

As we work to remove barriers to program access we must work to ensure a strong Out-of-School Time (OST) workforce, pipeline of professionals ready to serve, and incentives and development opportunities that also create career pathways and a leadership pipeline. While front-line staff tend to reflect the communities they work in, our field hasn't been able to retain and grow staff, particularly staff of color, into leadership positions. Many youth development leaders strive to advance equity, inclusion, and antiracism. However, a recent survey found that while 67% of front-line staff were people of color, only 58% of site-level directors and 34% of executive directors were people of color.²

Across sectors, resumes and applications with traditionally white-sounding names receive 50% more callbacks than those with names perceived to be associated with Black people.³ Because of long-standing pay disparities, women, BIPOC (Black, Indigenous, and other People of Color), people in the LGBTQ+ community, and people from low-income communities are often at a disadvantage in salary negotiations, and this is particularly challenging when a salary range is not included in a job description.⁴ Once hired, Latinx women earn ~50% of what white men earn, roughly 54 cents to the dollar, and Black women make 64 cents to the dollar.⁵

Of course, inequity is not limited to race. One study showed 20% of staff who identify as LGBTQ+ feel bias against their sexual orientation has impacted their career advancement.⁶ Research indicates that 25% of transgender people have lost a job due to bias, and more

¹ Afterschool Alliance, www.afterschoolalliance.org/AA3PM/#challenges

² National AfterSchool Association, <https://tinyurl.com/OSTLandscapeSupportingEquity>

³ Poverty Action Lab, www.povertyactionlab.org/evaluation/discrimination-job-market-united-states

⁴ Show the Salary, <https://showthesalary.com/why-show-the-salary>

⁵ Oxfam, www.oxfamamerica.org

⁶ Building Movement Project, www.buildingmovementproject.org

than 75% have experienced some form of workplace discrimination.⁷ One-third of people with disabilities report experiencing bias at work, and more than half feel their careers are stalled.⁸ These are just a few examples among the many ways people experience discrimination due to their identity.

Finding a Way Forward

Because the OST sector is rooted in the principles of youth development including creating safe and welcoming spaces for all young people, the sector is primed to be a leader in using similar philosophies to enact equitable hiring and staff development practices. We realize there is a broader need for a comprehensive overhaul of job quality in our sector, from rethinking compensation to making benefits more accessible to creating career pathways. We can do better and we will absolutely need to in order to meet the current and future staffing demands of the growing OST field.

This guide is just the beginning of support needed to make comprehensive changes to systems, policies, funding, and practices.

This guide is intended to catalyze the OST workforce, our stakeholders and partners to examine systems, elevate practices and policies that will build and strengthen the field.

The guide includes three sections:

- 1. Recruitment and Hiring;**
- 2. Onboarding and Professional Development;**
- 3. Performance Reviews and Feedback.**

Each section includes best practices, guiding questions to support policy and practice changes, and no- to low-cost resources to support equitable hiring and staff development practices.

⁷ National Center for Transgender Equality, <https://transequality.org/issues/employment>

⁸ Center for Talent Innovation, https://www.talentinnovation.org/_private/assets/DisabilitiesInclusion_KeyFindings-CTI.pdf

SECTION 1: RECRUITMENT AND HIRING

Best Practices to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias in Recruitment and Hiring

- A. Establish fair, competitive wages and benefits to attract and retain qualified staff.
- B. Include the salary range for each position on the job posting, ensuring candidates who were previously underpaid receive fair compensation.
- C. Create qualifications reflecting the competencies needed to effectively do the job, carefully considering whether a degree is required or if the degree is a proxy for skills and knowledge.
- D. Be sure job postings include all physical requirements of the position as well as accommodations that can be made if needed.
- E. Ensure requirements are as inclusive as possible; for example, requiring access to reliable transportation is more inclusive than requiring car ownership, and requiring experience working with children is more inclusive than experience working in a child care center.
- F. Describe benefits available in detail (e.g., training, insurance options).
- G. Market positions in a variety of places to attract a diverse candidate pool. Post jobs internally as well as widely, including with affinity groups, community organizations, alumni groups, and other networks.
- H. Ensure those screening resumes and/or conducting interviews complete implicit bias training.
- I. Consider removing names and addresses from resumes prior to screening.
- J. Use a job description based rubric for resume screening and interviews.
- K. Ensure interviewees are asked the same questions and that more than one person conducts each interview.

Guiding Questions to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias in Recruitment and Hiring

- 1. Who is screening resumes and conducting interviews? Do they represent diverse backgrounds and perspectives? Have they been trained on mitigating implicit bias?
- 2. Where do we post our jobs?
- 3. How can we add transparency to the recruitment and hiring process (e.g., salary range disclosure)?
- 4. How might we update our job postings, website, and interview protocol to communicate our equity, inclusion, and antiracism commitment? To provide each candidate with a uniform hiring experience?

“Research shows that you’ll get MORE applicants by showing the salary on your job ad. With CharityJob, the UK charity sector’s biggest jobs board, recently shared [you’ll likely get twice the number of applicants if you show the salary](#). And, JobSite shared that they see a 25-35% drop in candidates when salaries are hidden.”⁹

**Resources to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias
in Recruitment and Hiring**

Type	Name	Description
Article	7 Practical Ways to Reduce Bias in Your Hiring	how biases impact interviews and how to mitigate bias in the hiring process
Article	Hiring For The Future: A Playbook For Building A Diverse, Inclusive & Equitable Workforce	equitable hiring best practices, reducing unconscious bias, the biggest errors companies make in attempts to address diversity in their hiring process
Article	The Workplace in 2020: How Employers Can Support Jobseekers With Disabilities	strategies for employers to mainstream disability-inclusion post pandemic
Article	Simple Ways to Take Gender Bias Out of Your Jobs	"gendered language" and how to eliminate it in job postings
Article	Hiring in the Age of Ageism / Guidelines on Interview and Employment Application Questions	tools and tips to avoid age discrimination when hiring, including specific sample interview questions
Article	Hiring Guide: Interviewing and Evaluating Moms Returning to Work	rethinking the interview/hiring process when considering moms returning to work who have had a "career pause"
Framework/Tool	Toolkit to Minimize Implicit Bias in Recruitment/Hiring	recruitment process, current and salient ideas for ensuring hiring practices are equitable and inclusive
Framework/Tool	Gender Decoder	analyzes job descriptions for subtle gendered terms

⁹ Show the Salary, <https://showthesalary.com/why-show-the-salary/>

Template	Hiring Rubric Starter Kit / Mitigate Bias in Hiring With a Simple Rubric	explains importance of using rubrics during the hiring process, includes sample rubrics to mitigate bias when assessing candidates
Template	How inclusive is your recruiting? Test against best practice here... / Inclusive Recruiting Tip Sheet	benefits of inclusive recruitment, key strategies to implement an equitable recruiting strategy, checklist to mitigate bias during the hiring and selection process
Template	How to Write a Mom-Friendly Job Description / Job Description Templates	on writing inclusive and mom-friendly job postings, pre-made job posting templates for various roles
Training	Kirwan Institute Implicit Bias Training	help in understanding the origins of implicit associations, uncover personal biases and learn strategies for addressing them, five modules divided into a short series of lessons, many completed in under 10 minutes
Training	Incorporating an Equity Lens into Your Hiring Practices	free 1.5 hour training with best practices and specific tools for explicating shaping a role to set candidates up for success, taking an anti-bias approach to interviewing and candidate evaluation
Training	Interrupting Implicit Bias in the Virtual Hiring Process	webinar (directed at school leaders) explains how to be inclusive during the virtual hiring process to cast a wider candidate net and address implicit bias in hiring
Training	eLesson: Unconscious Bias, Microsoft	free training course to help managers and employees counter bias in work environments

Training	Inclusive Hiring: Reducing Bias & Building Equity in the Hiring Process	free webinar, “how to recognize unconscious bias, how it impacts talent pipelines, and strategies to eliminate it,” provides various best practices for sourcing diverse candidate pools, building an equitable interview process and upholding fair screening practices
----------	---	--

Section 2: Onboarding and Professional Development (PD)

Best Practices to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias in Onboarding and PD

- A. Increase new employees’ ability to adapt by providing onboarding to the organizational and team culture and norms.
- B. Make all expectations explicitly clear for all new staff.
- C. Review the employee handbook for use of inclusive language (e.g., avoiding binary gender pronouns) and policies that are equitable to all staff (e.g., leave policies for all parents, floating holidays, gender-neutral bathrooms).
- D. Ensure inclusive group norms; for example, do not center team-building opportunities around evening events or holidays.
- E. Create professional development plans that support employee growth.
- F. Establish a transparent career pathway, with opportunities for advancement at least every 3-5 years.
- G. Offer safe channels for raising concerns about inclusion or other topics beyond going to a direct supervisor.

Guiding Questions to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias in Onboarding and PD

1. How are new staff onboarded to organizational culture, norms, and expectations?
2. How might we invest in all staff members’ professional development, equitably sharing resources so everyone has opportunities to learn and grow?
3. How do we prepare staff for and make decisions on promotions? Do staff know what is required of them to move up or to another position within the organization?

**Resources to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias
in Onboarding and PD**

Type	Name	Description
Article	Inclusion starts on day one: 10 ways to build an inclusive onboarding experience	10 different ways to make your onboarding process more inclusive
Article	The ultimate guide to inclusive onboarding	tips for making new hires feel welcome and included during onboarding
Article	How to make your onboarding more inclusive for your Black colleagues	tangible steps organizations can take to make their onboarding process (first day, week and month) more inclusive for their Black employees
Article	How to Build an Inclusive Onboarding Process	creating and maintaining an inclusive employee environment through the onboarding period by reducing bias, engaging new hires and implementing a mentoring program
Article	Diversity at Day One: Best Onboarding Practices for Women of Color	onboarding practices to help retain women of color in the workplace
Article	The Key to Equity is Employee Onboarding. Part II: Here's How	ways to enable new hires to succeed and actualize their potential during onboarding, includes onboarding template and resource guide
Article	How to improve equity in advancement, training and talent development	tips to improve equity in training and talent development
Framework/Tool	Building a Better Workplace: 10 Drivers for Women's Success at Work	research framework based on data from over 1,000 working mothers, the top 10 drivers for women's success at work, research included hidden yet critical success predictors, including non-traditional benefits, workplace environment and leadership support

Template	Inclusive Onboarding Checklist	things employers can do to make onboarding more equitable, organized by time period ranging from before the new hire starts to 7-12 months afterward
----------	--	--

SECTION 3: PERFORMANCE REVIEWS AND FEEDBACK

Best Practices to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias in Performance Reviews and Feedback

- A. Ensure all staff have completed implicit bias training.
- B. Use a uniform performance review template based on a performance rubric, and have someone read each review before it is delivered to staff to provide a second perspective.
- C. Set expectations and performance goals with each employee at the beginning of each year. Meet bi-annually to review progress and areas for growth.
- D. Ensure all supervisors have participated in training on giving feedback such that all staff have equal opportunity for effective coaching.
- E. Create a process for 360° feedback, giving each staff member a safe, confidential opportunity to provide feedback on their supervisor and colleagues.
- F. Provide opportunities for staff to set goals at least annually.
- G. In addition to reviewing performance, review responsibilities at least annually, and make adjustments to salaries to account for increased cost of living, additional experience, and also to titles when an employee is doing work beyond their current job description.

Guiding Questions to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias in Performance Reviews and Feedback

- 1. How are supervisors prepared in advance of giving feedback or conducting a performance review?
- 2. What measures are in place to ensure staff feel safe giving feedback about programs, organizational policy/practices, supervision, and other aspects of their work experience?
- 3. What needs to happen from a budgeting and funding perspective to ensure annual pay increases and pay equity reviews?

**Resources to Increase Equity and Mitigate Bias
in Performance Reviews and Feedback**

Type	Name	Description
Article	Why Most Performance Evaluations Are Biased, and How to Fix Them	Addressing unconscious bias in performance evaluations, steps to fix ambiguity in performance management
Article	Diversity, Inclusion, and Anonymous Feedback	pros and cons of anonymous feedback, tips/resources on providing anonymous feedback
Article	How Gender Bias Corrupts Performance Reviews, and What to Do About It	gender bias in performance evaluation/feedback process, how biases are manifested, steps to redesigning performance evaluation towards a more equitable system.
Article	Using Behavioral Design to Close the Gender Pay Gap	behavioral design strategies to redesign workplace norms and facilitate more equitable decision making to help close the gender pay gap
Framework/Tool	Mitigating Bias in Performance Management	frameworks, resources and tips to mitigate unconscious bias in performance evaluation
Framework/Tool	Reimagining Compensation Decisions through an Equity Panel	how to use equity panels to support equitable compensation decision
Framework/Tool	Tools for Managers and HR: How to Interrupt Bias in Performance Evaluations	recognize bias in performance evaluations across different groups
Framework/Tool	5 Steps to a Performance Evaluation System	framework with five key steps organizations should take to establish a performance management evaluation system that provides an equitable measurement of an employee's contributions

Conclusion and Call to Action

Given research on the importance of staff and leaders in creating quality youth experiences, NAA supports, develops, and advocates for OST professionals and leaders. Equity, access, and connections are the through-lines across all NAA's work. We achieve our goals by collaborating with NAA members, board, state affiliates, partners, and other stakeholders through convenings, communications, and capacity building.

NAA's 30,000+ members represent many voices, roles, and experiences but are united in a commitment to quality programs for young people, families, and communities. It's time for us to work together, close the diversity gap, and seize the opportunity to shape a different future for our field, a future that values OST programs and recognizes, rewards, and provides professionals from various backgrounds with advancement opportunities.

Zakir McKenzie Parpia, Director of Programs from California School-Age Consortium, NAA's California State Affiliate, said it best,

“Without intentional and explicit practices, tools and frameworks, combined with an unwavering personal commitment from every ally in a position of power, broader systems will not change.”

We propose a collaborative effort with all stakeholders--including the professionals who do this work--to cultivate a broader cultural shift that respects and values the significant influence of this essential workforce. Our field needs actions that support equity, quality OST, and adequate, holistic compensation for carrying this invaluable workforce forward.

Your ideas, participation, and engagement in this effort are vital. Please watch for additional information through NAA communications and convenings and direct any related comments or questions to Angelica Portillo, NAA's Director of Advocacy and Workforce Initiatives, Angelica@naaweb.org.